

Alternatives Criteria	Do Nothing	Reduced Lane Widths with Paved Shoulders and Rumble Strips	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalks and On-Street Buffered Bike Lanes	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalk on East Side and Multi-use Path on West Side	Reduced Lane Widths and Multi-Use Paths
<b>Transportation</b>					
<b>Improves traffic operations</b>	• No change to traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations
<b>Improves traffic safety</b>	• No change to traffic safety	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds
<b>Encourages some trucks to use other truck routes</b>	• No change to truck traffic	• Slower traffic speeds as a result of reduced lane widths may encourage truck diversion	• Slower traffic speeds as a result of reduced lane widths may encourage truck diversion	• Slower traffic speeds as a result of reduced lane widths may encourage truck diversion	• Slower traffic speeds as a result of reduced lane widths may encourage truck diversion
<b>Improves road geometrics</b>	• No change to road alignment	• No change to road alignment	• Improvements to road geometry	• Improvements to road geometry	• Improvements to road geometry
<b>Conforms to transportation planning policies and plans</b>	• Not consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans
<b>Maintains emergency response time</b>	• No change to emergency response time	• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles	• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles	• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles	• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles
<b>Natural Environment</b>					
<b>Complies with Provincial environmental planning policies</b>	• Located within Oak Ridges Moraine (south of Cranston Drive to Caledon Trailway)	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options
	• Located within Greenbelt Plan Area (south of Cranston Drive to Caledon Trailway)	• Generally consistent with Greenbelt Plan with improved conditions for active transportation	• Provides active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options which is consistent with policies of the Greenbelt Plan. Caledon East is a Settlement Area under the Greenbelt Plan and the policies for settlement areas support complete communities (e.g., mixed-use neighbourhoods) that offer opportunities for people of all ages and abilities to conveniently access most necessities for daily living, including a mix of jobs, local stores and services, housing, transportation options and public service facilities.	• Provides active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options which is consistent with policies of the Greenbelt Plan. Caledon East is a Settlement Area under the Greenbelt Plan and the policies for settlement areas support complete communities (e.g., mixed-use neighbourhoods) that offer opportunities for people of all ages and abilities to conveniently access most necessities for daily living, including a mix of jobs, local stores and services, housing, transportation options and public service facilities.	• Provides active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options which is consistent with policies of the Greenbelt Plan. Caledon East is a Settlement Area under the Greenbelt Plan and the policies for settlement areas support complete communities (e.g., mixed-use neighbourhoods) that offer opportunities for people of all ages and abilities to conveniently access most necessities for daily living, including a mix of jobs, local stores and services, housing, transportation options and public service facilities.
<b>Avoids or reduces negative impacts on natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat</b>	• Avoids negative impacts on natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• Minimal impacts to natural heritage features	• Encroaches into locally significant wetlands and minimum protection zones; May result in a direct loss of an unevaluated wetland community • Moderate tree removal • Minor extension to culvert • No anticipated impacts to species at risk and their habitat	• Encroaches into locally significant wetlands and minimum protection zones; May result in a direct loss of an unevaluated wetland community • Moderate tree removal • Minor extension to culvert • No anticipated impacts to species at risk and their habitat	• Encroaches into locally significant wetlands and minimum protection zones; May result in a direct loss of an unevaluated wetland community • Moderate tree removal • Minor extension to culvert • No anticipated impacts to species at risk and their habitat
<b>Introduces opportunity to protect and/or enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat</b>	• No opportunity to enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• Does not increase potential for vehicle-wildlife conflicts	• No opportunity to enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• No opportunity to enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• No opportunity to enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat
<b>Maintains or reduces risk for natural hazards</b>	• No opportunity to reduce risk for natural hazards	• Generally similar impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff as existing condition • No change to treatment (existing ditches) for stormwater runoff • Sediment and erosion control plan will be applied during construction	• Generally similar impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff as existing condition • Opportunity to treat stormwater runoff • Sediment and erosion control will be applied during construction	• Generally similar impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff as existing condition • Opportunity to treat stormwater runoff • Sediment and erosion control will be applied during construction	• Generally similar impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff as existing condition • Opportunity to treat stormwater runoff • Sediment and erosion control will be applied during construction
<b>Protects sources of drinking water</b>	• Located within Wellhead Protection Area	• Part of corridor is located within Wellhead Protection Area	• Part of corridor is located within Wellhead Protection Area	• Part of corridor is located within Wellhead Protection Area	• Part of corridor is located within Wellhead Protection Area
	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area
	• Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas
<b>Provides opportunity to adapt to or mitigate the effects of climate change</b>	• No opportunity to adapt to or mitigate the effects of climate change	• Low opportunity for low impact development • No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated	• Potential for low impact development may be restricted in wellhead protection areas • No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated	• Potential for low impact development may be restricted in wellhead protection areas • No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated	• Potential for low impact development may be restricted in wellhead protection areas • No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated

Alternatives	Do Nothing	Reduced Lane Widths with Paved Shoulders and Rumble Strips	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalks and On-Street Buffered Bike Lanes	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalk on East Side and Multi-use Path on West Side	Reduced Lane Widths and Multi-Use Paths
<b>Healthy Communities</b>					
<b>Provides for active transportation</b>	• Sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and Hilltop Drive	• Does not fill sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and Hilltop Drive	• Fills sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive; Provides active transportation link between Mono Road community and Caledon East	• Fills sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive; Provides active transportation link between Mono Road community and Caledon East	• Fills sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive; Provides active transportation link between Mono Road community and Caledon East
	• No active transportation facilities	• Paved shoulders to accommodate pedestrians and cyclists	• New sidewalks and bike lanes to accommodate pedestrians and cyclists Improved cycling facility; Possibly more desirable than multi-use path(s) for utilitarian cyclists (e.g., long-distance or commuter cyclists) and less for recreational cyclists	• Sidewalk and multi-use path to accommodate pedestrians and cyclists • Improved cycling facility; Possibly more desirable than bike lanes for recreational cyclists and less desirable than bike lanes for utilitarian cyclists	• Multi-use paths to accommodate pedestrians and cyclists • Improved cycling facility; Possibly more desirable than bike lanes for recreational cyclists and less desirable than bike lanes for utilitarian cyclists
<b>Reduces risk of chronic conditions through active transportation</b>	• No opportunity to promote healthy (active) environments	• Continuous cycling facilities between paved shoulder in rural area and urban area	• Continuous cycling facilities between paved shoulder in rural area and bike lane in urban area	• Non-continuous pedestrian and cycling facilities between paved shoulder in rural area and sidewalk or multi-use path in urban area	• Non-continuous pedestrian and cycling facilities between paved shoulder in rural area and multi-use path in urban area
		• No separation between pedestrians and cyclists • Buffer (separation) between pedestrians and roadway; Rumble strips deter vehicles from crossing over to shoulder	• Separated walking and cycling facility • Less physical separation between pedestrians (sidewalk) and roadway than alternatives with multi-use path(s); Cycling facility is designated on-road	• Shared walking and cycling facility • More physical separation between pedestrians or cyclists (multi-use path) and the roadway than alternatives with bike lanes; Cycling facility is off-road	• Shared walking and cycling facility • More physical separation between pedestrians or cyclists (multi-use paths) with the roadway than alternatives with bike lanes; Cycling facility is off-road
		• Paved shoulders improve surface accessibility compared to granular shoulders	• Less comfort for recreational cyclists than alternatives with multi-use path(s); Little to no separation between cyclists and motorized traffic; Potential buffer between bike lane and travel lane is less than separation in alternatives with multi-use path(s)	• Less overall cyclist comfort than alternatives with bike lanes; Provides wide separation between cyclists and motorized traffic with no separation between cyclists and pedestrians	• Less overall cyclist comfort than alternatives with bike lanes; Provides wide separation between cyclists and motorized traffic with no separation between cyclists and pedestrians
		• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means • No reduction in design speed • Limited potential for tree planting in rural cross-section	• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means • No reduction in design speed • Number of trees within urban area will increase to extent possible, with consideration to provide shade for active transportation infrastructure	• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means • No reduction in design speed • Number of trees within urban area will increase to extent possible, with consideration to provide shade for active transportation infrastructure	• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means • No reduction in design speed • Number of trees within urban area will increase to extent possible, with consideration to provide shade for active transportation infrastructure
<b>Supports age friendly and accessible living</b>	• Not improved to standards of Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	• Paved shoulders may not be comfortable for all pedestrians and cyclists	• Designed to standards of Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	• Designed to standards of Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	• Designed to standards of Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act
<b>Reduces risk of respiratory and cardiovascular outcomes associated with exposure to traffic related air pollution</b>	• Avoids air quality impacts	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario • Increased dust during construction will be controlled by an Emissions Management Plan	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario • Increased dust during construction will be controlled by Emissions Management Plan	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario • Increased dust during construction will be controlled by Emissions Management Plan	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario • Increased dust during construction will be controlled by Emissions Management Plan
<b>Avoids or reduces noise impacts</b>	• Avoids noise impacts	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors • Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors, although noise barriers will be implemented where warranted • Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors, although noise barriers will be implemented where warranted • Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors, although noise barriers will be implemented where warranted • Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice
<b>Social, Cultural and Economic Environment</b>					
<b>Conforms to Municipal planning policies and community plans</b>	• Not consistent with Municipal planning policies and community plans	• Generally consistent with Region of Peel Official Plan	• Generally consistent with Region of Peel Official Plan	• Generally consistent with Region of Peel Official Plan	• Generally consistent with Region of Peel Official Plan
		• Generally consistent with Town of Caledon Official Plan and Caledon East Community Improvement Plan	• Generally consistent with Town of Caledon Official Plan and Caledon East Community Improvement Plan	• Generally consistent with Town of Caledon Official Plan and Caledon East Community Improvement Plan	• Generally consistent with Town of Caledon Official Plan and Caledon East Community Improvement Plan
<b>Compatible with existing and planned future land uses</b>	• No impact on existing and planned future land uses	• Rural cross-sections are generally upgraded to urban within settlement areas, however the settlement area of Mono Road is outside the development area and will remain within a rural area	• Urban cross-section is compatible with existing and planned future land uses between south of Cranston Drive to south of Hilltop Drive	• Urban cross-section is compatible with existing and planned future land uses between south of Cranston Drive to south of Hilltop Drive	• Urban cross-section is compatible with existing and planned future land uses between south of Cranston Drive to south of Hilltop Drive
<b>Avoids or reduces property impacts</b>	• Avoids property impacts	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements
<b>Avoids or reduces negative impacts on cultural heritage features</b>	• Avoids negative impacts on cultural heritage features	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (7 listed on the built heritage resource inventory; one with high significance, and one potential built heritage resource)  • Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (7 listed on the built heritage resource inventory; one with high significance, and one potential built heritage resource)  • Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (7 listed on the built heritage resource inventory; one with high significance, and one potential built heritage resource)  • Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (7 listed on the built heritage resource inventory; one with high significance, and one potential built heritage resource)  • Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way

Alternatives Criteria	Do Nothing	Reduced Lane Widths with Paved Shoulders and Rumble Strips	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalks and On-Street Buffered Bike Lanes	Reduced Lane Widths, Sidewalk on East Side and Multi-use Path on West Side	Reduced Lane Widths and Multi-Use Paths
<b>Supports goods movement</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Airport Road is a goods movement corridor</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor</li> <li>Design will accommodate transport and commercial trucks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor</li> <li>Design will accommodate transport and commercial trucks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor</li> <li>Design will accommodate transport and commercial trucks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor</li> <li>Design will accommodate transport and commercial trucks</li> </ul>
<b>Supports local economic sustainability</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on customer access to business frontages</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on customer access to businesses</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on customer access to business frontages</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on customer access to business frontages provided multi-use path is designed with some clearance to building frontage (e.g., 0.5-1.0m from building face)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on customer access to business frontages provided multi-use paths are designed with some clearance to building frontage (e.g., 0.5-1.0m from building face)</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to on-street parking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to on-street parking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to on-street parking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to on-street parking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to on-street parking</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to tourism potential</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to tourism potential</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to tourism potential</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to tourism potential</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact to tourism potential</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No opportunity to improve streetscape and aesthetics</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited potential for tree planting in rural cross-section</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Potential for improvements to streetscape and aesthetics, with potential to maintain or enhance treelined corridor to balance street form and function</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Potential for improvements to streetscape and aesthetics, with potential to maintain or enhance treelined corridor to balance street form and function</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Potential for improvements to streetscape and aesthetics, with potential to maintain or enhance treelined corridor to balance street form and function</li> </ul>
<b>Reduces complexity of construction</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>South of Cranston Drive to Hilltop Drive is located within Prime Agricultural Area</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on Prime Agricultural Area</li> <li>Accommodates for farm vehicles</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on Prime Agricultural Area</li> <li>Designing for farm vehicles not ideal in urban area with raised curbs; Potential for farm vehicles to encroach onto bike lane</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on Prime Agricultural Area</li> <li>Designing for farm vehicles not ideal in urban area with raised curbs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on Prime Agricultural Area</li> <li>Designing for farm vehicles not ideal in urban area with raised curbs</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No conflict with utilities and municipal infrastructure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No conflict with utilities and municipal infrastructure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minor utility and municipal infrastructure to be relocated or impacted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minor utility and municipal infrastructure to be relocated</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Utility and municipal infrastructure to be relocated</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No construction staging</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minor temporary traffic impact due to construction staging</li> <li>Minor boulevard construction and grading improvements</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate temporary traffic impact due to staging of storm sewers</li> <li>Full boulevard reconstruction and potential drainage modification</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate temporary traffic impact due to staging of storm sewers</li> <li>Full boulevard reconstruction and potential drainage modification</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate temporary traffic impact due to staging of storm sewers</li> <li>Full boulevard reconstruction and potential drainage modification</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No construction cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Low cost to construct due to less drainage, street lighting and material costs compared to other alternatives</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>High cost to construct due to full boulevard reconstruction with higher drainage, street lighting and material costs than other alternatives</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate cost to construct due to full boulevard reconstruction with moderate drainage, street lighting and material costs compared to other alternatives</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate cost to construct due to full boulevard reconstruction with moderate drainage, street lighting and material costs compared to other alternatives</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No change to operations and maintenance cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Low operations and maintenance cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate ongoing cost to operate and maintain</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate ongoing cost to operate and maintain</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Moderate ongoing cost to operate and maintain</li> </ul>
<b>Evaluation</b>					
<b>Summary</b>	<p><b>Not Carried Forward</b></p> <p>Does not address problem and opportunity (included for comparison)</p>	<p><b>Preferred in EA for the rural section between Olde Base Line Road and Cranston Drive due to anticipated utilization and cost</b></p> <p>Provides a functional cycling and walking facility adjacent to predominately agricultural land uses between Olde Base Line Road and Cranston Drive (provides improved conditions for cycling and walking in rural area compared to existing). Low cost to construct compared to other alternatives.</p>	<p><b>Not Preferred in EA due to less separation between bike lane and travel lane</b></p> <p>Continuous cycling facilities between rural and urban areas. However, separation between bike lane and travel lane is less compared to other alternatives; and bike lanes are anticipated to be less comfortable for recreational cyclists. The cost to construct is anticipated to be higher than other alternatives, with moderate ongoing cost to operate and maintain.</p>	<p><b>Not Preferred in EA due to less separation between bike and travel lanes on east side</b></p> <p>Non-continuous pedestrian and cycling facilities between rural and urban area, however more desirable than bike lanes for recreational cyclists with wide separation between cyclists and motorized traffic. Fills sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive. Less cost to construct than bike lanes with moderate operations and maintenance costs compared to other alternatives. Less preferred than multi-use path on both sides due to less separation between bike and travel lanes on east side.</p>	<p><b>Preferred in EA for the urban section between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive due to greatest separation between bike and travel lanes</b></p> <p>Non-continuous pedestrian and cycling facilities between rural and urban area, however more desirable than bike lanes for recreational cyclists with wide separation between cyclists and motorized traffic. Fills sidewalk gap between Cranston Drive and south of Hilltop Drive. Moderate cost to construct than bike lanes with moderate operations and maintenance costs compared to other alternatives.</p>